

Review Form

Paper Title: Modelling Response to Innovations in Industrialized Regions: the Russian Experience

Reviewer's Name: Valery Zh. Dubrovsky

(The reviewers' identities remain anonymous to author/s)

❖ **Recommendation to Editor** (Please mark "x" for appropriate option)

- Excellent, accept the submission (5)
 Good, accept the submission with minor revisions required (4)
 Acceptable, revisions required (3)
 Resubmit for review, major revisions required (2)
 Decline the submission (1)

The editor will forward the below part to author/s

❖ **Evaluation** (Please evaluate the manuscript by grade 1-5)

5=Excellent 4=Good 3=Average 2=Below Average 1=Poor

Items	Grade
Contribution to existing knowledge	4
Organization and Readability	5
Soundness of methodology	4
Evidence supports conclusion	4
Adequacy of literature review	5

❖ **Strengths**

1. The paper is of interest in fundamental science and practice; its authors develop the conceptual framework in innovation studies and propose their definition for an original concept of the response to innovations.
2. The authors propose to understand the response to innovations as a response of the economy to changes to multiple factors: a condition of the science, the market, the industrial policy, etc. The idea is correct and amazing and the authors have managed to formalize it. The models presented in the paper, are mathematically correct, the findings and conclusions are well grounded.
3. The paper refers to exciting and unique data on a process of de-industrialization (re-industrialization) in the Russian regions.

❖ **Weaknesses**

It is not clear why in their evaluation of the response to innovations in the production sector to actions made by the government, the authors' focus is exclusively an analysis of measures to support entrepreneurs with funds from regional budgets, while the federal level of the public administration is ignored, whereas in the Russian real life, it has the most intensive influence on regional economies. Thus, an observed revival of the industrial production in the Kaluga Oblast and the Tula Oblast has been mostly caused by federal grants and public contracts instead of regional grants.

❖ **Suggestions to Author/s**

1. It will be useful to enlarge a review of literature on process simulation in industrialized countries.
2. The paper should be more specific on the authors' definition of the "abnormal multistructurality" term and distinctive features of this phenomenon.

Reviewer:

Name: Valery

Last name: Dubrovsky

Reviewer's e-mail: dubr@usue.ru

Organization: Ural State University of Economics